```
WEBVTT
1 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:20:47.939 --> 00:21:07.939
Oh.
2 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:25:07.939 --> 00:25:12.839
Huh.
3 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:25:12.839 --> 00:25:29.219
Hello.
4 "Mike Nemes" (1649391104)
00:31:01.649 --> 00:31:07.859
Hello.
5 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:32:14.429 --> 00:32:24.149
What's that? This is the 1 on 1. sorry sorry.
6 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:32:24.149 --> 00:32:31.349
Oh, I like that. Yeah and then you can just use.
7 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:32:31.349 --> 00:32:51.349
Sure wrong.
8 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:35:41.139 --> 00:35:44.969
Well, I think we can begin.
9 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:35:48.569 --> 00:35:53.459
We have a quorum, so I think we can begin. Would you take the role?
Please.
10 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:35:53.459 --> 00:36:00.719
Representative Jason name is.
11 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:00.719 --> 00:36:07.289
Co chair role Jones, Senator Neil.
12 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:07.289 --> 00:36:10.589
Senator Julie, Rocky Adams.
13 "Mike Nemes" (1649391104)
00:36:10.589 --> 00:36:16.727
Senator Mike name is representative.
14 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:16.727 --> 00:36:21.629
Fleming representative Pamela Stevenson.
15 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:21.629 --> 00:36:28.289
Councilman Anthony council Cory Arthur.
16 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:28.289 --> 00:36:35.609
Councilwoman Cindy Fowler. Maryann Butler here.
17 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:35.609 --> 00:36:39.209
Toby Somerville here.
18 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
```

```
00:36:39.209 --> 00:36:43.169
Scott schoenberger.
19 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:43.169 --> 00:36:50.467
Mayer Bonnie Jim chief Sean.
20 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:50.467 --> 00:36:58.469
21 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:36:58.469 --> 00:37:04.019
Would you have a quorum so let's begin I think the on the agenda that you
all received, but I think the.
22 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:37:04.019 --> 00:37:09.059
1st item up is, um, a data presentation.
23 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:37:09.059 --> 00:37:16.499
By Dr Jones good afternoon afternoon.
24 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:37:16.499 --> 00:37:36.499
This will be fairly like, today, compared to our, the last few months of
meetings we're basically running out of things that we can measure. Well,
and now we're into sort of clean up mode and tweaking mode. Um, there's 1
new item that we want to put on the record today about occupation.
25 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:37:36.499 --> 00:37:47.879
Taxes and then Bill as an extension of the sensitive Government's
analysis that he presented last time, there's, there's 2 items that.
26 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:37:47.879 --> 00:38:07.879
We're we'll finish up this summer, uh, Corey asked us to widen the scope
of the capital expenditures database and we have that scheduled. I just I
need some time with staff to go through it because it's thousands of
records and we'll get to that probably by the next meeting.
27 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:38:07.879 --> 00:38:28.669
You, and then also there's a bunch of technical questions about the rest
of the metro council metro budget that I've got into, and they were tied
up with last year's budget. So, they've promised me they were going to
give me some time once they get back from vacation. So those 2 items will
report later.
28 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:38:28.669 --> 00:38:37.350
So, there's really only 1 thing I've got to show today and it's a little
bit geeky and and I'm not gonna make it overly technical or, um.
29 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:38:37.350 --> 00:38:53.310
I'll get in the weeds too much. I just want to get this in the record in
case it ever comes up on who is paying the occupational taxes across the
5 jurisdictions in the county that Levy it. You might remember that.
30 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:38:53.310 --> 00:39:01.890
We all know about metro loving a 1.25%, uh, tax uh, you can see in the
table to the left there.
```

```
31 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:01.890 --> 00:39:13.770
There's there are the tax rates for the other jurisdictions J town at 1%
St matthew's 3 quarters of a percent traveling 2% and West mutual at 1
and a half percent.
32 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:13.770 --> 00:39:32.490
And you can see the amount of revenue that they generated in the last
fiscal year that we've got, you know, consistent data on, adds up to
330Million. But as you can see from the chart, Metro certainly dominates,
um, the magnitude of the of the.
33 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:32.490 --> 00:39:44.790
Revenues, but what I want to talk about today is a method that we've used
very cornerstone and old colleague of mine did most of this work and I
just pulled it together.
34 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:44.790 --> 00:39:50.610
Um, this is from a census bureau program called on the map.
35 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:50.610 --> 00:39:56.280
Or another name for the underlying program is longitudinal.
36 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:39:56.280 --> 00:40:13.260
And player household dynamics, and basically all that means is, they've
used unemployment insurance records at the micro level at the individual
level. They know where you work, what industry you work in the, the place
where you work.
37 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:13.260 --> 00:40:16.620
And they know what your earnings are.
38 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:16.620 --> 00:40:23.610
But they can cross match that they know your social security number. They
know your home address.
39 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:23.610 --> 00:40:27.180
And so now we know where people.
40 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:27.180 --> 00:40:30.360
Live versus where they work.
41 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:30.360 --> 00:40:38.940
And Barry has done this at the census tract level and it also at the
suburban city's level, he's actually allocated this.
42 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:38.940 --> 00:40:45.540
For all these 5 occupational tax jurisdictions to all of the 83 cities.
43 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:45.540 --> 00:40:53.640
And then I've just aggregated it up to the total of suburban cities. So
here's the AHA for metro government.
44 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:53.640 --> 00:40:58.380
```

```
For the last almost 20 years.
45 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:40:58.380 --> 00:41:10.710
And you can see, it's pretty consistent and looks like the unincorporated
part of the county residents. There are generating looks like about 37.
46 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:10.710 --> 00:41:13.980
Of the occupational taxes for Metro.
47 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:13.980 --> 00:41:19.260
Oh, might surprise you that outside the county is 2nd highest.
48 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:19.260 --> 00:41:23.940
So we know this from the school board reconciliation.
49 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:23.940 --> 00:41:30.600
Oh, are you sort of veterans at this know that the school board.
50 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:30.600 --> 00:41:37.380
As an occupational tax, but you don't pay it if you're a non resident. So
you can look at the 2 series.
51 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:37.380 --> 00:41:48.510
And adjust for the tax rates and figure out that actually 28% of the
workers in Jefferson County, the workers earnings are paid by people that
are not residents.
52 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:41:48.510 --> 00:42:01.170
So, it's a commuter tax, right? But it applies to people from southern
Indiana bullet County, Shelby County, Oldham County, Henry County, et
cetera all over the region. So they're the 2nd, biggest contributors.
53 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:01.170 --> 00:42:05.220
At least the way we've organized our geography to metro government.
54 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:05.220 --> 00:42:11.490
Revenues, uh, urban service district is 3rd looks like about 20.
55 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:11.490 --> 00:42:16.680
The occupational taxes are paid by residents in the urban service
district.
56 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:16.680 --> 00:42:20.250
And then the suburban cities, which, you know, is a smaller population
base.
57 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:20.250 --> 00:42:25.620
Looks like it's about 16% so.
58 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:25.620 --> 00:42:33.900
There we are, and it looks pretty stable, although it looks like it's a,
the unincorporated piece is creeping up.
59 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:33.900 --> 00:42:44.460
```

```
As it would be given what we know about the demographics, the last 20
years, where the unincorporated areas now about 50% of the county's
population.
60 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:44.460 --> 00:42:49.590
Now, the next slide is very busy, but I can.
61 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:49.590 --> 00:42:54.450
Sort of summarize it for easily. These are the 4 other.
62 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:54.450 --> 00:42:58.470
Um, municipalities that Levy and occupational tax.
63 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:42:58.470 --> 00:43:02.040
So the top left is J town.
64 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:02.040 --> 00:43:09.570
And they literally a 1% occupational tax. So Barry did the same analysis
using this on the map program.
65 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:09.570 --> 00:43:13.650
To allocate the earnings back to the place of residence.
66 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:13.650 --> 00:43:26.070
You can see this 1 is quite skewed towards I guess you would call it the
far suburbs and exurbia and surrounding counties more than the other 3.
67 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:26.070 --> 00:43:33.090
Jurisdictions and that makes sense because it's the most southeast of any
of these municipalities.
68 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:33.090 --> 00:43:43.710
If you if you look below that at, you can see it's a little more, um,
dominated or contributed from urban service district.
69 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:43.710 --> 00:43:49.830
Because obviously, it's adjacent to the urban service district. They get
more workers from their.
70 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:43:49.830 --> 00:44:02.610
Uh, Matthews and West mutual, or you can study it and I'm not sure it has
any policy implications for you right now. I, just if something comes up.
71 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:02.610 --> 00:44:10.800
And we need to refer to the data know that we now have this data
organized and here's a summary across.
72 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:10.800 --> 00:44:15.570
All of those 5 jurisdictions that Levy, the occupational tax.
73 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:15.570 --> 00:44:20.010
Um, so.
74 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:20.010 --> 00:44:23.190
```

```
That's it any questions.
75 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:23.190 --> 00:44:28.260
I have a couple, but I want to check. Does any of the commissioners have
any questions?
76 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:32.130 --> 00:44:39.750
Can you go back to your initial your opening remark when you you said
that.
77 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:39.750 --> 00:44:44.190
But the data tell me again, what the source of the date is.
78 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:44.190 --> 00:44:49.050
And, um, well, let's start with that. Okay.
79 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:49.050 --> 00:44:57.060
So, this, it's this on the map program from the Census Bureau, but it's
really, uh, underneath driven by.
80 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:44:57.060 --> 00:45:01.650
Uh, the unemployment insurance, quarterly payments.
81 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:01.650 --> 00:45:20.160
Basically, almost all businesses are required to pay to join the
unemployment insurance system of Kentucky or whatever state they're in.
Right? And they have to follow these quarterly payments and there's an
insurance premium paid upon the payroll of every employer.
82 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:20.160 --> 00:45:27.390
So, that generates records on the number of employees at that business
establishment.
83 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:27.390 --> 00:45:31.770
So when we know what industry they're in, um.
84 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:31.770 --> 00:45:36.150
And we also know the social security numbers.
85 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:36.150 --> 00:45:39.240
Of the workers.
86 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:39.240 --> 00:45:43.140
And we know the addresses of the workers.
87 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:43.140 --> 00:45:47.880
So, if you were to file, if you were laid off from, I don't know.
88 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:47.880 --> 00:45:54.870
Um, Ford or UPS or general, electric or anyplace, and you file for
unemployment assistance.
89 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:54.870 --> 00:45:58.920
```

```
They obviously know your address because they're going to send you a
check.
90 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:45:58.920 --> 00:46:06.630
Or that address, so that's that's what's going on under the hood. And
this is not aggregate. This is micro data.
91 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:06.630 --> 00:46:10.230
Individual level data and.
92 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:10.230 --> 00:46:14.670
They have populated this back to 2001.
93 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:14.670 --> 00:46:20.970
Thankfully, which coincides with our study period. Now, it only goes
through 2019.
94 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:20.970 --> 00:46:25.200
I'm sorry, this is well, this is 21.
95 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:25.200 --> 00:46:29.250
This is not the on the map data. Here's the on the map data.
96 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:29.250 --> 00:46:36.480
This data goes from 2002 to 2019.
97 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:36.480 --> 00:46:44.280
Matt actually works with the Census Bureau. He knows more about it than
me. If you want to add anything map I'm not sure when they will.
98 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:44.280 --> 00:46:51.630
Let the 2020 data out. It's probably pretty soon, but all the they have
now is 2019.
99 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:51.630 --> 00:46:57.600
Yeah, did I did I explained correctly the source of the data? Yep.
100 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:46:57.600 --> 00:47:04.350
Okay, so, and I'm assuming that we don't have any information at this
point, which would indicate that after 2019 there's any significant.
101 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:04.350 --> 00:47:18.660
Differences in these trends or these, the direction which these data are
moving, is that right? It looks pretty stable to me. I can't imagine it's
gonna change much in 24,021. so now walk walk us through again. Then what
you all did with these data.
102 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:18.660 --> 00:47:22.080
Okay, so.
103 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:22.080 --> 00:47:26.700
If you if you pick a place.
104 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:26.700 --> 00:47:33.690
```

```
In this program, uh, say, the urban service district. Okay. So it knows
geographically.
105 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:33.690 --> 00:47:36.780
All the businesses inside the urban service district.
106 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:36.780 --> 00:47:40.080
Every 1 of them, and then.
107 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:40.080 --> 00:47:46.140
It spins and finds out where all those workers in those businesses live.
108 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:46.140 --> 00:47:51.120
Down to the census track am I right matters at block level?
109 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:51.120 --> 00:47:58.080
I think it's block level, which is very micro so they know basically what
neighborhood you live in.
110 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:47:58.080 --> 00:48:09.930
The database does not reveal street addresses, but it aggregates to the
block level. And Barry did this analysis at the census tract level, which
is roughly 2000 people.
111 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:09.930 --> 00:48:15.420
And he also did it analysis to the city level. So he knows.
112 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:15.420 --> 00:48:19.440
Indian hills saint Matthew.
113 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:19.440 --> 00:48:24.180
Um, that is all built into this program. It knows.
114 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:24.180 --> 00:48:30.510
The addresses how they aggregate up to any jurisdiction you want to pick.
115 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:30.510 --> 00:48:35.220
So, the data that's available in the system, what you've done is, you
will have plotted the.
116 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:35.220 --> 00:48:41.190
Uh, with the with the, the residents of the people whose earnings have
been.
117 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:41.190 --> 00:48:51.720
Otherwise see, right? Yes. Okay. Do you have this the same database? Give
the ability to say where those, where those, uh, they earn their wages.
118 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:51.720 --> 00:48:56.880
So, that's what this is this is where they earned their wages. I thought
this was where they.
119 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:48:56.880 --> 00:49:01.920
It's it's jobs and earnings, but we use the earnings data.
```

```
120 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:01.920 --> 00:49:13.500
The actual payroll data, because that's the base that you pay your
occupational tax on. So so this, this is reflecting the earnings of
people.
121 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:13.500 --> 00:49:17.490
That live in, let's say the suburban cities.
122 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:17.490 --> 00:49:24.150
Paying occupational taxes to, to, in this case, Metro government.
123 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:24.150 --> 00:49:28.320
And then the.
124 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:28.320 --> 00:49:33.210
So, and then the data that you indicated from the, the particular cities.
125 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:33.210 --> 00:49:38.820
That just shows the same data basically, except broken down into those
jurisdictions. Is that right?
126 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:38.820 --> 00:49:42.600
Broken down what? Those jurisdictions? Yes yes.
127 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:42.600 --> 00:49:46.290
Yes, okay. We've got.
128 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:46.290 --> 00:49:50.850
We've got more detail than this. I'm just so that when it says suburban
cities.
129 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:50.850 --> 00:49:58.890
That's actually the sum of all 83 suburban cities. We, we've got the
individuals of urban cities in the database.
130 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:49:58.890 --> 00:50:02.940
In a spreadsheet that I use to calculate suburban cities.
131 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:02.940 --> 00:50:09.090
Thanks okay. And by the way, you.
132 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:09.090 --> 00:50:13.620
The 1 handout that Brian sent around yesterday.
133 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:13.620 --> 00:50:29.400
On the cross jurisdiction issues with EMS and fire, we're going to skip
that because we've discovered a conflict with what metro safe is showing.
So we'll come back next month and have that cleaned up for you.
134 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:29.400 --> 00:50:33.270
So, that's all I have and then I think Bill is up next.
135 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:33.270 --> 00:50:41.130
```

```
See, if I can find this.
136 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:41.130 --> 00:50:46.530
They need some help on the, um.
137 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:50:46.530 --> 00:51:00.510
The other slideshow, Doug. Oh, here it is. I'm sorry.
138 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:00.510 --> 00:51:06.120
Bill, okay, there you go.
139 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:06.120 --> 00:51:09.270
I think you just use the scroll down there.
140 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:09.270 --> 00:51:16.050
It will send to a PDF here. Okay. Yeah. So I can.
141 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:29.910 --> 00:51:49.910
There okay, so, um, is Paul said there, this is kind of a continuation on
of some of what was done at our last meeting regarding comparisons of
Jefferson County, and this, uh, set of other metropolitan counties
associated with.
142 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:49.910 --> 00:51:57.210
Uh, metropolitan areas that, uh, we think are, um, interesting
comparisons and, um.
143 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:51:57.210 --> 00:52:16.200
So, I want to talk rather than last time was more focus on the
expenditure side. This is going to be a focus on the revenue side. And I
guess there are a couple things to, to take away from this sort of
thinking in advance that I think will be a parent is.
144 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:52:16.200 --> 00:52:36.200
You know, 1 thing to think about is sort of the trends and are there any
noticeable trends? I think the short answer is no, 1st, sort of global.
There was not a particular break in magnitude of revenue collections, or
the source of magnitude of revenue collections with the merger. And I
think that's kind of.
145 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:52:36.200 --> 00:52:44.430
Consistent with some of what Paul had shown there and then, of course,
comparisons between, um.
146 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:52:44.430 --> 00:53:04.430
These metro counties, and sort of the level of revenues, and you'll see
that as well as Lexington are are low relative to these other ones. I
think part of the explanation there is, is the role of the state and
state aid, and we explore a little bit of that, though. You'll see
that's.
147 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:53:04.430 --> 00:53:24.430
The full answer and then, of course, importantly is, um, we actually have
a very different source of revenue than some of the other metropolitan
```

```
areas. And I'm guessing all of this stuff is not a big surprise to you.
Um, so I'll kind of talk through fairly quickly. I think you can sort of
review this.
148 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:53:24.430 --> 00:53:39.630
On your own, or, and of course, happy to answer any kind of questions. So
before doing that 1 thing that did come up last time and concerns about
population growth and what I reported last time they were an error.
149 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:53:39.630 --> 00:53:49.740
And so this is revised and we are pretty confident we've got it right
here. Growth. I think, um.
150 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:53:49.740 --> 00:54:04.290
You can see it there, the red line for local, and you'll see that
significantly below the growth of of Lexington at the top. And then the
black is Nashville um, higher than than a number of the other cities.
But, um.
151 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:04.290 --> 00:54:07.740
Again, that that gives us a population growth.
152 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:07.740 --> 00:54:23.310
We're going to focus when we think about taxes in terms of employment,
both employment and earnings. So it's kind of useful to sort of think
about maybe trends and sort of where we stand relative to others in both
of those.
153 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:23.310 --> 00:54:32.400
So, here's the employment growth. No surprise. It looks pretty similar to
what we would find. Um.
154 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:32.400 --> 00:54:50.640
Uh, compared to the population growth, I don't think too surprised again,
if you always, if you think about, in the figure that 2003 break point,
that line tend to sort of look on that and there are any breaks and
you'll see, uh, nothing really discernible a steady growth, but.
155 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:50.640 --> 00:54:54.210
Consistent with the population, um.
156 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:54:54.210 --> 00:54:58.560
Go ahead question Tony. Oh.
157 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:55:14.760 --> 00:55:31.770
Industry is it people want to live in the county? Is it do you have any
idea? Well, you know, that's an interesting question. And and if you're
following sort of Lexington Fayette County, current, uh, policy, um.
158 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:55:31.770 --> 00:55:35.190
Somewhat surprising because, uh.
159 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:55:35.190 --> 00:55:45.360
```

```
You know, we have again an urban service district, um, but we have not
expanded that since 91993inanyreally significant way.
160 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:55:45.360 --> 00:55:48.510
Um, so this has really sort of.
161 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:55:48.510 --> 00:56:00.690
Come about, um, despite sort of significant expansions have been a few
ones. We're currently talking about, uh, uh, uh, expansion now. So, um.
162 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:56:00.690 --> 00:56:15.360
You know, so I don't, I guess short, I don't have a great answer for why
that is. I mean, uh, the University of Kentucky is a major employer and
has expanded pretty significantly during that period. Um.
163 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:56:15.360 --> 00:56:35.360
So, it could relate education, economics and hospital sector right?
Driving force there. I don't know that Toyota is is expanded that
significantly in this, but some of it might be that as well that being in
Georgetown. I'm sure there would be sort of bedroom folks, but not that
many. I would think that Scott county would be the 1 that would explode.
164 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:56:35.360 --> 00:56:55.360
Toyota yeah, well, of course, we could investigate that with the, on the
map program that Paul was just looking at. Um, but, uh, I'm not sure I
have a good answer. It's interesting that I have to admit somewhat
surprising as a Lexington resident makes me kind of curious about this,
um, employment growth again kind of.
165 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:56:55.360 --> 00:56:58.620
Here's the population growth.
166 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:56:58.620 --> 00:57:04.920
So the other thing is, is per worker working these, these data expressed
in terms of what by the way.
167 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:04.920 --> 00:57:08.280
Okay, this is, uh, uh.
168 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:08.280 --> 00:57:25.230
Yeah, I'm sorry for the growth employment relative to 1992. so, what does
that mean? So, for example, it looks like in 2017, Lexington, or is,
let's say about 1.3 kind of the middle there.
169 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:25.230 --> 00:57:28.590
I, I'm pointing on the screen. I know that doesn't help much. Sorry.
170 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:28.590 --> 00:57:37.170
Okay, so that's about 1.3. so that means it is 30 higher population than
it had in 1992.
171 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:37.170 --> 00:57:50.310
nashville's population is looks like maybe 1.55 in 2017. it has grown
since 1992 by 55%.
```

```
172 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:50.310 --> 00:57:53.550
Um, so, uh.
173 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:53.550 --> 00:57:58.230
That's kind of how we interpret it so it's relative population rather
than.
174 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:57:58.230 --> 00:58:11.190
Comparing cities counties that have very different populations. Let's say
what the growth is and that's what we're trying to do here. So you were
referring to, in responding to the mayor's question about Lexington
versus Louisville.
175 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:11.190 --> 00:58:18.990
You said something about we hadn't had any significant expansion since
then what were you referring to a trial urban service district?
176 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:18.990 --> 00:58:23.310
In in, in in a county.
177 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:23.310 --> 00:58:43.310
There was a change in 1993, but pretty minimal changes. there've been
some zoning changes and stuff, but we have not expanded the sort of speak
the footprint of of our infrastructure. You say we referring to Alexi?
I'm sorry. Yeah, I got.
178 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:43.310 --> 00:58:49.230
On today uh, yes, yeah. So sorry. Yeah.
179 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:49.230 --> 00:58:55.350
Got to remember, I'm in the other place here. Yeah, Lexington is not not.
180 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:58:55.350 --> 00:59:04.530
Changed and by the way, I'm not taking personal credit for any of the
policy. So and the same is true then of Louisville is right because your
christie's data here reflect the entire county.
181 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:59:04.530 --> 00:59:13.770
Yeah, yeah, so, um, uh, I frankly, I'm not not really familiar with
what's happened to your urban services. That's been steady since.
182 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:59:13.770 --> 00:59:16.860
2003.
183 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:59:16.860 --> 00:59:21.930
The, I don't know the answer that question. Yeah. Okay. Yeah. Yeah.
184 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:59:21.930 --> 00:59:27.030
Yeah okay so per worker earnings, um.
185 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
00:59:27.030 --> 00:59:30.480
And I think what I, what we want to do here is.
186 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
```

00:59:30.480 --> 00:59:41.940 Uh, we'll look at sort of taxes per capita, but, uh, I think the, the real story, I quess, earnings I'm going to focus on more when we talk about taxes. Um. 187 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 00:59:41.940 --> 00:59:47.070 And the reason is that I think that's closer to a tax rate. 188 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 00:59:47.070 --> 01:00:07.070 If you think about taxes per earnings, not that, of course earnings are the base for all the taxes in, in any of these counties. But I think it gives a, you know, maybe a better indication of kind of what the, the taxes that people face are is based on earnings, more more than than workers. Um, this. 189 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:07.070 --> 01:00:18.150 Kind of on some of Paul's point I'm looking at per worker earnings of of workers in Jefferson County. Not in terms of residence. 190 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:18.150 --> 01:00:36.450 Of Jefferson County, so is Paul mentioned about 28% of those workers in the in Jefferson County are coming from outside the county, and they are included in this. This comes from the Bureau of economic analysis. You can they report it either way earnings. 191 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:36.450 --> 01:00:43.290 Of residents, earnings workers, we chose to look at workers here and why did you do that as opposed to the other way. 192 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:43.290 --> 01:00:47.520 Well, um, so, uh. 193 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:47.520 --> 01:00:51.570 We chose to do that. I guess maybe in part. 194 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:51.570 --> 01:00:56.250 Um, because of the occupational license tax. 195 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:00:56.250 --> 01:01:03.210 Having a big role here and that is based on location of employment. 196 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:01:03.210 --> 01:01:23.210 Uh, and so that's, I think maybe why, 1, good reason for doing that. We could argue that, for example, the property tax would be better to sort of think about that in terms of residents. Um, but we wanted to sort of have 1 thing consistent and so that's why we went with that, um, for some of the other city. 197 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:01:23.210 --> 01:01:27.060 It may may be less representative of kind of what the, the. 198 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:01:27.060 --> 01:01:41.040

```
Tax of a worker would be facing. So so I think that's part of and I guess
I'd say the other thing is, if we think about, in terms of the
incentives, how taxes might influence, um.
199 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:01:41.040 --> 01:01:45.720
From location, employment decisions, maybe this is a little better
measure.
200 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:01:45.720 --> 01:01:54.540
we went back to the to the question that you asked earlier about the whys
do you have any explanation for what's happening here
201 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:01:54.540 --> 01:01:57.630
With worker earnings.
202 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:01:57.630 --> 01:02:08.370
Well, you know, I think a couple of couple things 1 thing we are not
adjusting for is, for example, education levels.
203 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:08.370 --> 01:02:13.320
You know, if we were to say, okay, let's look at the earnings of.
204 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:13.320 --> 01:02:21.180
Of someone with a college degree, let's look at somebody with a college
degree age 35, or whatever it might be. Um.
205 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:21.180 --> 01:02:41.180
You know, that may change the, the picture significantly my guess is
that, um, the Lexington is I have to admit is is a surprise there,
because we have a fairly high. I'm sorry, we Lexington has a fairly high
a level of education, so that that's a bit surprising. But that may be.
206 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:41.180 --> 01:02:45.420
Be part of the explanation is different rates of college attendance.
207 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:45.420 --> 01:02:56.820
Um, different, uh, industrial composition could be as well. Uh, so I
don't have a a, a real good story for that. It's just something I haven't
explored.
208 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:02:56.820 --> 01:03:00.960
I think I could explain that that chart bill.
209 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:00.960 --> 01:03:04.560
If you look at the ones that have the highest earnings.
210 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:04.560 --> 01:03:10.140
These are the most urbanized places that have a lot of corporate
headquarters.
211 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:10.140 --> 01:03:13.800
So, in Indianapolis, Cincinnati.
212 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:13.800 --> 01:03:20.880
```

```
Nashville right? Mm. Hmm. And so they're booming with, uh, high end
office jobs.
213 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:20.880 --> 01:03:29.940
Memphis is low. Doesn't surprise me. Birmingham is low or? Well, it looks
like Louisville basically.
214 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:29.940 --> 01:03:34.050
So, it's, it's a, to me this represents.
215 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:34.050 --> 01:03:44.970
The presence of a lot of high end office jobs and Lexington, of course,
as UK, but I can't think of any major corporate headquarters there.
216 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:44.970 --> 01:03:53.940
Yeah, sorry Clark Clark equipment. Uh, so that's our 1 I think um, okay.
217 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:03:53.940 --> 01:04:10.380
So, I'm going to so, so now we come to kind of a government revenues 1st,
uh, per capita basis. We're course adjusted for inflation and you can see
some pretty dramatic, uh.
218 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:10.380 --> 01:04:14.370
Differences in revenue per capita, a little bit about what this is.
219 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:14.370 --> 01:04:21.120
So, what we've done is, um, aggregate all of the.
220 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:21.120 --> 01:04:24.180
Uh, tax and charges.
221 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:24.180 --> 01:04:30.810
In, um, each of the counties associated with these, these cities.
222 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:30.810 --> 01:04:40.260
Excluding the school district taxes. Okay so we've excluded those. This
comes from the census of government. Um.
223 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:40.260 --> 01:04:46.230
And so you can see some, some, some big distinctions here. Um.
224 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:46.230 --> 01:04:49.260
And I think a lot of this has to do.
225 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:49.260 --> 01:04:55.830
Uh, if you see that, not only national high, but also, Memphis.
226 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:55.830 --> 01:04:59.340
A bigger role for the local government relative to the state.
227 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:04:59.340 --> 01:05:05.580
Certainly in Tennessee more more is done at the local level if you think
about, um.
228 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
```

```
01:05:05.580 --> 01:05:10.710
Local tax revenue, there's a local sales tax.
229 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:10.710 --> 01:05:24.540
Uh, there that, um, you know, for example, we don't have in in generally
a bigger role for the local government. So, I think that explains a lot
of it. Why there's so much higher than than the rest of the.
230 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:24.540 --> 01:05:29.430
Yeah, um, cities. Okay.
231 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:29.430 --> 01:05:32.970
If you had put the school districts in there.
232 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:32.970 --> 01:05:39.060
I guess would probably explode it. Maybe.
233 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:39.060 --> 01:05:47.130
Maybe, um, so could it be that? Maybe Birmingham has 2 districts 2 school
districts in Birmingham would.
234 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:47.130 --> 01:05:58.770
If there was, for instance, would that have made a difference for you to
put those numbers in there? Yeah. I don't know. I mean, it would shift,
of course, everything up. And I guess the question is.
235 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:05:58.770 --> 01:06:18.770
Uh, of course, how much are they collecting for schools and I think 1 of
the questions there is, how big a role does the state have in the school
finances, right? And, you know, we do have a pretty big share, so I'm not
sure we would have shifted all that much.
236 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:18.770 --> 01:06:31.680
With label having a budget of what 2Billion whatever the budget is. I
think that would make a significant well, it certainly would increase.
Yeah, no, no question. Yeah. Yeah.
237 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:31.680 --> 01:06:37.170
No question about that. Yeah, probably, you know, double. Right? That's
what I was. Thank you. Thank you. Yeah.
238 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:37.170 --> 01:06:46.920
I don't think there's really much difference in terms of the story,
particularly for, for Louisville. Um.
239 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:46.920 --> 01:06:51.600
Uh, here, uh, very steady when some of the other, um.
240 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:51.600 --> 01:06:57.780
Counties have not been steady and again, this is per capita adjusted for
inflation.
241 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:06:57.780 --> 01:07:04.290
So, um, for renewable flat, but of course, that's just meaning that.
```

```
242 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:04.290 --> 01:07:08.850
That the rate of increase in taxes has just been keeping up with
inflation basically.
243 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:08.850 --> 01:07:25.500
And you can see, Lexington, for example, is increasing at a faster rate
and others are declining, probably declining because of, um, not so much
tax cuts. But but the effects of inflation in Texas beat tax rates, being
constant.
244 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:25.500 --> 01:07:44.640
Okay, so that's per capita. So percentage of earnings, as I said, I think
this is maybe more relevant and here's something to think about. And why,
in part why we do is maybe to get back to some of the earlier question
about why the percentage of earnings.
245 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:44.640 --> 01:07:47.760
Is, um, you know.
246 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:47.760 --> 01:07:53.370
Saying it's per worker versus per, um, as a share of earnings.
247 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:07:53.370 --> 01:08:05.850
How much a worker earns is going to affect kind of the relative 1. so it,
it could be that, uh, for example, if we have a low, um.
248 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:05.850 --> 01:08:09.030
Taxes per worker.
249 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:09.030 --> 01:08:13.020
But we have very low wages as well.
250 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:13.020 --> 01:08:17.400
It could be that as a percentage of earnings, they might be quite high.
251 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:17.400 --> 01:08:29.220
All right, um, it doesn't look like that's the case here, uh, for total
revenue, but it's something we wanted to try to try to get at. It's kind
of and again, it's trying to get at the idea that.
252 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:29.220 --> 01:08:35.100
We can think about this, maybe as a proxy for kind of, uh, a tax rate.
253 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:35.100 --> 01:08:42.390
It effective taxes per earnings, quick question, just to clarify the last
slide. This slide.
254 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:42.390 --> 01:08:49.290
Would be safe to say, minus the last slides, uh, you know, with
Lexington.
255 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:49.290 --> 01:08:54.510
You know, extra, almost a Minimus level above where we were.
```

```
256 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:08:54.510 --> 01:09:00.420
Or below where we were, whether you're looking at it, a per capita, or
percentage earnings.
257 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:00.420 --> 01:09:05.730
Amongst these pure cities we're comparing to, we are, we are the cheapest
city to live in.
258 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:05.730 --> 01:09:15.840
Uh, with respect to taxes, right? Yeah, yeah and it's yeah, I think this
shows, it's kind of robust. You pick either measure, uh.
259 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:15.840 --> 01:09:28.590
Uh, is is on the bottom and 1 thing, uh, bringing up here uh, you can
kind of see that taxes per capita were going up again.
260 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:28.590 --> 01:09:37.710
We're going up for say, Lexington, and I think part of the story about
now, if you go to this 1, it's pretty flat for Lexington.
261 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:37.710 --> 01:09:57.710
That's because those earnings were growing faster than the rate of
inflation in Lexington. Right? White flattened out. Right? And if I were
to translate the same thing, if you flip to the last slide. Yeah. Same
thing with law. We see from 2012, 2017, a pretty dramatic increase in
taxes per capita, but when you flip the next slide, you see, it's
actually.
262 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:09:57.710 --> 01:10:09.600
Of the same period. Very flat. So the assumption would be that earnings
were matching the piece of that tax growth per capita. Yeah. So the, the
real net effect is.
263 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:09.600 --> 01:10:14.040
Right, yeah, yeah, yeah. Right. So so, yeah, right. That's.
264 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:14.040 --> 01:10:25.830
Which is an excellent story if we could do a better job of communicating
that outside of our city. And here, here you see the per capita
earnings going up there, right? Yeah.
265 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:25.830 --> 01:10:30.300
Yep, great, thank you. Yep. Real quick though. Um.
266 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:30.300 --> 01:10:40.380
We talked about sources and uses in the last meeting. Yeah. And you said
that there are some that have the ability locally to charge sales tax
that's absorbed into their.
267 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:40.380 --> 01:10:44.580
As well, we're here, the sales tax goes up to the state, right?
268 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:10:44.580 --> 01:10:56.640
```

Yeah, that's right. So I think we need to take that into consideration as it relates to that because this is only reflecting the income that we're getting from insurance occupational, real estate.

269 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:10:56.640 --> 01:11:16.640

Yeah, and you will see, I'll just aggregate some of this stuff in just a moment. Okay. You'll see kind of how the sources and there's a striking difference in sources. And I think maybe when we think about about cities, you know, the occupational license is going to jump out here right for us to kind of clarify what totally.

270 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:11:16.640 --> 01:11:26.580

Right, right we've had this debate, uh, a ton and I would love to see a change in in that, uh, state, uh, in the state and how they.

271 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:11:26.580 --> 01:11:30.690

Allow local governments to, to manage those types of things.

272 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:11:30.690 --> 01:11:47.550

But just to be clear, even though that is true, we are still looking at apples to apples comparison. In other words, you're looking at all revenue sources across these jurisdictions that pay for their service. Yeah, that's right. Right. So yeah, so so so just to be clear Scott, that

273 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:11:47.550 --> 01:12:07.550

That is very true, but theoretically, even if we did that, we might offset like, there might we could, let's just say for the heck of it. The constitutionally we could, we could have local sales tax. Right? We might have 1, but we might also opt to reduce the occupational tax and offset the total.

274 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:12:07.550 --> 01:12:14.670

Revenue per capita, right. Um, so, anyway. Yeah, so so, but but I do want to make sure that.

275 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:12:14.670 --> 01:12:18.810

What I was saying is true. What I think you're trying to convey is true.

276 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:12:18.810 --> 01:12:23.580

That no matter what the revenue sources, which sounds like you're going to cover in a 2nd.

277 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:12:23.580 --> 01:12:43.580

the total revenue coming in we're not it's not as though we're looking at jurisdictions that have to pay for different services that we do they're paying for similar services they opt to pay for it in different ways we spend more money on it yeah that's exactly right and and i think it would become kind of pronounced in uh here in a moment and you know as you said 278 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

01:12:43.580 --> 01:12:51.420

Of course, that's I think 1 of the arguments for local sales tax, uh, here is to reduce an occupational license tax.

279 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)

```
01:12:51.420 --> 01:12:58.080
Okay, uh, inner governmental revenue.
280 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:12:58.080 --> 01:13:14.160
Um, and you can kind of see here that again. So, uh, we, we are, um,
somewhat surprisingly, I think at at the lower end of thing is a
percentage of earnings.
281 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:13:14.160 --> 01:13:17.280
Um, but relatively steady.
282 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:13:17.280 --> 01:13:32.130
Sorry. Dr. can I get a quick quick question on this? By inter,
governmental revenue? Are you talking about like, state federal grants?
Like, for example, state road money that comes to Jefferson County and
that's what you're counting in here. Yeah, yeah. That's right. And, um.
283 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:13:32.130 --> 01:13:35.820
So so, for example, like.
284 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:13:35.820 --> 01:13:55.820
Again, I'm just thinking about a narrative here and you tell me if I'm
incorrect in stating it on the prior slide, we could say, oh, it's really
good news, you know, per capita we are charging less per person in tax
revenue than some of these other pure cities the flip side is I look at
this, and I think to myself, okay, this is telling me these other
jurisdictions or.
285 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:13:55.820 --> 01:14:10.560
Feel like much more love from their state government as an example that
we are. And as a matter of fact, it's it's in decline. If I look at it in
2017 2017. yeah. Now I will say the 1 point to bring up is.
286 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:10.560 --> 01:14:16.020
Um, maybe distinguishing love for your city versus your love for your
educational system.
287 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:16.020 --> 01:14:23.220
And had we had we thrown in, I think we would have a different
story had we looked at education.
288 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:23.220 --> 01:14:28.620
Yeah, uh, which, you know, of course, is obviously a big share, but.
289 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:28.620 --> 01:14:33.360
Yeah, so yeah, road money, right? That's what we're talking about. Um.
290 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:33.360 --> 01:14:39.090
And, uh, again, total taxes, kind of a similar story. Um.
291 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:39.090 --> 01:14:42.180
Here, uh, as a percentage of earnings.
292 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:42.180 --> 01:14:48.000
```

```
Um, and okay.
293 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:48.000 --> 01:14:51.750
Ok, so now, let's let's get a little higher, um.
294 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:14:51.750 --> 01:15:01.710
I'll get get some shifts up here and so this is where we're de saturated.
So the occupation license tax is categorized by the census of governments
is an income tax.
295 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:01.710 --> 01:15:06.240
Okay, um, and, uh, uh.
296 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:06.240 --> 01:15:16.020
You know, and this is 1 of the arguments for doing the earnings, because
it's going to match better with the earnings of workers than it is the
earnings of residents because.
297 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:16.020 --> 01:15:34.590
It's based on location of employment, but you can kind of see again, both
Louisville and, uh, Lexington are very different from most of the others
you'll see. Cincinnati is in between as well. Uh, that is an income tax
it that Ohio has rather than.
298 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:34.590 --> 01:15:42.900
Uh, an earnings tax. Okay. Well, okay, sales taxes are basically 0.
299 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:42.900 --> 01:15:58.560
These include selective sales taxes, excise taxes too. So that's why it's
not not equal to 0. it's not just the general sales tax. Um, but you'll
see some real differences in what's collected.
300 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:15:58.560 --> 01:16:06.930
Okay, and then property taxes those are these are taxes by the.
301 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:06.930 --> 01:16:11.100
The by the municipality, these are local sales taxes.
302 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:11.100 --> 01:16:14.610
Yeah, these are local sales taxes. Um.
303 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:14.610 --> 01:16:23.130
And, uh, so, right as we sort of talked about, um, local sales tax is an
option in, um.
304 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:23.130 --> 01:16:33.360
Uh, Tennessee in Alabama. Um, Cincinnati has, I think a, a small 1 isn't
that to pay for the stadium?
305 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:33.360 --> 01:16:43.980
I think that's right it's a bond associated with the bond for the stadium
so a very small 1 and some, some selective ones darker. Yeah. Quick
question.
306 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
```

```
01:16:43.980 --> 01:16:48.060
Could we after this meeting, whenever you have a moment.
307 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:48.060 --> 01:16:52.140
Organize the data a little differently. I'd be interested to see.
308 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:52.140 --> 01:16:59.430
So, this is very helpful as a percentage of earnings in comparison again,
apples to apples amongst these cities.
309 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:16:59.430 --> 01:17:19.430
Think bar chart 100% at the top. So, each bar is going to be 100 then
shaded areas. Okay so so, what is the distribution, correct? Yeah, that's
a good idea. Because I'm wondering, like, again, it wouldn't show us
this. It's 2 different stories. This is telling us that still as a
percentage of earnings. These are relatively low.
310 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:17:19.430 --> 01:17:30.030
These cities, but I'm curious about to your point, the distribution of,
you know, if ours is going to be your occupational property tax, a little
bit of income, a little bit of a sales tax.
311 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:17:30.030 --> 01:17:50.030
And then there's going to be sales tax property tax, you know, and just
how different that looks amongst these other. Yeah. Yeah. That's a that's
an excellent idea. And we, we certainly can do that. Thank you very much.
Appreciate it. Yeah. W W. we can, we can do that and send that just
forward to the commission before the meeting. That'll be. That's an easy
thing to do and it, it'll be. You're right. You're exactly right. It'll
give you a much better.
312 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:17:50.030 --> 01:17:53.970
Field and trying to go from slide to slide like this.
313 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:17:53.970 --> 01:17:57.270
Okay, uh, property taxes.
314 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:17:57.270 --> 01:18:17.270
Um, you know, I don't know how well known it is, but we are as a state,
and you can see both for those have always been a low tax state and we're
ranking in the bottom 5 of of property taxes. So, we're, we're, uh, if
traditionally been a low property tax state.
315 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:17.270 --> 01:18:21.630
And, uh, and you can see sort of, um.
316 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:21.630 --> 01:18:27.030
Uh, Tennessee is, is on the high end of that.
317 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:27.030 --> 01:18:34.710
Um, okay, so I think that is it for me.
318 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:34.710 --> 01:18:49.260
```

```
Any other questions questions, any other suggestions so I'll take that 1
down and about getting the distribution. That's that's a.
319 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:49.260 --> 01:18:52.950
Will be an easy thing to do, and I think would be pretty, pretty
insightful.
320 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:18:56.400 --> 01:19:00.510
Okay, thank you. All right.
321 "5026****18" (3392855808)
01:19:09.871 --> 01:19:17.640
Earl, this is Jason names. Can you hear me? Yes. Yes, Jason. Hi. I just
want to let, you know, I've just left Clark.
322 "5026****18" (3392855808)
01:19:17.640 --> 01:19:23.130
Circuit court about 20 minutes ago and I'm attending, uh, on my drive
back so I apologize.
323 "5026****18" (3392855808)
01:19:23.130 --> 01:19:29.713
Thanks, I've been in trial all morning all day.
324 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:19:29.713 --> 01:19:36.780
Probably take a risk at this point. Um, okay, so we're now no sleep til
Brooklyn.
325 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:19:36.780 --> 01:19:47.940
Want to turn to the committees please and see what they've got a report.
I I know Mr. Fleming apparently is in Alaska and I don't know whether
he's had a chance to join us yet or not.
326 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:19:47.940 --> 01:19:51.810
Let's hope you still above water.
327 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:19:51.810 --> 01:19:57.210
And so, Scott, do you want to report something for gaps?
328 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:19:57.210 --> 01:20:10.470
Sure, we met earlier this week and had what I think was a very productive
meeting overall. So Dr cuban's and I will be meeting to.
329 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:10.470 --> 01:20:22.860
Begin to generate our report overall, which will, which will take a
little bit of time. We're really going to work on some quantitative and
kind of quantitative analysis here.
330 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:22.860 --> 01:20:32.880
So, we're excited to do that. In addition to that we had talked about the
potential of seeing if we could get a representative from the PVA in.
331 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:32.880 --> 01:20:40.050
To help us and I don't I don't know what that process would be, but to
help us understand the review process. Um.
332 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:40.050 --> 01:20:43.170
```

```
As it relates to some specific municipalities.
333 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:43.170 --> 01:20:49.410
Or areas, neighborhoods who, and I'm sorry, the PBA, a representative
from the PBA if you recall.
334 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:20:49.410 --> 01:20:56.880
So, I deferring that to the chair, so that or to someone here that may be
able to help us with that.
335 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:21:09.840 --> 01:21:28.050
I think that's it. I do think that we wanted them to come to the
commission not specifically to the committee.
336 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:21:28.050 --> 01:21:33.150
Is that right from the to have them come.
337 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:21:33.150 --> 01:21:40.904
To the commissioner to the committee Julie.
338 "julie raque adams" (3153658880)
01:21:40.904 --> 01:21:45.720
I'm I'm trying to unmute here. I thought that we were just.
339 "julie raque adams" (3153658880)
01:21:45.720 --> 01:21:56.743
Going to have the process as a committee so that we could understand if
it was useful for the full commission.
340 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:21:56.743 --> 01:22:00.330
Yep, that then the committee I'll defer to my yeah.
341 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:00.330 --> 01:22:03.480
Other committee members, correct?
342 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:03.480 --> 01:22:14.970
Yeah, so well, the only other thing I, that I can recall, uh, is that we
were.
343 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:14.970 --> 01:22:22.440
Had requested some people, somebody representing some of the city
agencies to appear and that still has not yet happened. We're.
344 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:22.440 --> 01:22:35.760
I think we're still trying to work something out on that score, but
there's somebody here today, if, if I could, I believe they will be here
in August. They're still going through some of the data and some of the
questions we had last time.
345 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:35.760 --> 01:22:42.570
And I know, I'm sorry, that would be in the, the commissions meeting in
August.
346 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:22:42.570 --> 01:23:00.204
I can't recall what the Datas for that Brian the meeting next meeting
meeting what date.
```

```
347 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312)
01:23:00.204 --> 01:23:04.920
2nd, yes, I am trying to get there right now August, 11.
348 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312)
01:23:04.920 --> 01:23:10.024
Friday, August 11.
349 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:10.024 --> 01:23:14.070
Is there a commitment? Do you know Marianne that they will? Somebody will
be here on that day?
350 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:14.070 --> 01:23:17.190
Yes, you know, who not yet.
351 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:20.970 --> 01:23:27.330
We'll send the best people to be able to answer the questions that were
raised at the last meeting.
352 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:27.330 --> 01:23:37.140
And I noticed that in our handouts, we got the information from metro
safe about the fire runs and the runs.
353 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:37.140 --> 01:23:42.150
I haven't seen that yet, but.
354 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:42.150 --> 01:23:45.930
My understanding is that we're going to be talking about that at the next
meeting. Is that right?
355 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:45.930 --> 01:23:50.100
Because that data is throughout the different from the data that I guess.
356 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:50.100 --> 01:23:54.030
This team is collected, so we'll address that next time.
357 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:23:58.110 --> 01:24:07.650
Okay, so the only thing I wanted to mention other than what is the, we
have our 1st mission, our 1st public meeting tomorrow.
358 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:07.650 --> 01:24:11.100
Um, and, um.
359 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:11.100 --> 01:24:16.530
I think everybody's got an invitation, and I'd like to know how many
people are going to be at that meeting.
360 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:16.530 --> 01:24:28.803
I think we need to understand that, uh, can you take role please to find
out who's going to be at the meeting? I'll be there as well. Okay.
361 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:28.803 --> 01:24:37.410
Okay.
362 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:37.410 --> 01:24:42.281
```

```
Representative Jason Nina is.
363 "5026****18" (3392855808)
01:24:42.281 --> 01:24:54.335
I don't think I'll be there hold on county. I think I have to go.
364 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:24:54.335 --> 01:24:59.141
Senator Neil, Senator, Julie, Rocky atoms.
365 "Mike Nemes" (1649391104)
01:24:59.141 --> 01:25:08.517
I'll be there, thank you Senator. Mike name is well, not I'll be on the
team. Thank you.
366 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:08.517 --> 01:25:13.440
Representative Ken Fleming representative Pamela Stevenson.
367 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:13.440 --> 01:25:18.330
Council member Anthony, thank you.
368 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:18.330 --> 01:25:22.710
Councilmen Corey Arthur council woman's any.
369 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:22.710 --> 01:25:28.230
Thank you Marianne Butler? Yes, Shelby Williams. Summerville.
370 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:28.230 --> 01:25:32.520
Yes, thank you. Scott schoenberger.
371 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:32.520 --> 01:25:39.210
Mayor bunny, John, and she drives Becker.
372 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:39.210 --> 01:25:46.290
Drives back sorry no longer on the call.
373 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:25:46.290 --> 01:26:00.000
Okay, okay thanks. I think that is all I had is anybody have anything
else to add? I guess we'll, uh, Jason, I will talk about about the
conduct of the.
374 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:00.000 --> 01:26:06.660
But the meeting tomorrow, if my understanding, when we talked about this,
initially that the.
375 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:06.660 --> 01:26:10.770
That when when metro government is headed to meetings with residents.
376 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:10.770 --> 01:26:19.110
The normal practice it into it's a couple of feedback or taking in
information and I guess that would be the.
377 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:19.110 --> 01:26:24.570
The preference here as well. Um, I'm curious to see what happens at this
meeting whether or not.
378 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:24.570 --> 01:26:29.040
```

```
People are going to be content to simply have their, their say, and let
them go with that. But.
379 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:29.040 --> 01:26:35.550
We'll probably learn something tomorrow and we'll keep learning on the
process as we go along and.
380 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:35.550 --> 01:26:42.180
Just, if we need, she came in, I just like to thank the metro staff.
381 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:42.180 --> 01:26:45.660
All of you all for putting all this together um.
382 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:26:45.660 --> 01:27:04.320
Doctor comes you all have done outstanding work, and if I didn't have 2
fingers in 2 hands in a calculator, I could never figure out what's going
on. So I appreciate all of the time and energy you're putting in. This is
really hard. I think it's extremely important. I know this.
383 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:04.320 --> 01:27:23.310
Is the 3rd look at merger since merger happened in 2023 I've read a 2015
report and, uh, I think did 1 at 1 time. So I think it's wonderful that
we go back through and that we are check doing our checks and balances.
384 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:23.310 --> 01:27:28.260
Make sure we're doing what we should do so I, I just want to thank you
all for doing that. I appreciate it.
385 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:28.260 --> 01:27:38.610
Let's say, I want to add my thanks to the staff here. I think they've
gone above and beyond since this was not part of their work plan. At
least as far as I understand it.
386 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:38.610 --> 01:27:44.940
Um, and so I think that they've done a great job really appreciate it.
And Brian has been a.
387 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:44.940 --> 01:27:51.660
Um, let's see, really diving in to get things done quickly and
efficiently.
388 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968)
01:27:51.660 --> 01:28:00.913
Let's not forget the clerks. Yes. Okay. Can you hear me this is Brian
Powell speaking? Yes. Yes. All right.
389 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312)
01:28:00.913 --> 01:28:08.400
Thank you. I apologize. I just want to jump in really quick. Obviously.
Thank you guys very much for your time words Thank you to the clerk's
office. Thank you to metro TV.
390 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312)
01:28:08.400 --> 01:28:13.260
For making sure that all of these are on Webex and easily seen.
391 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312)
01:28:13.260 --> 01:28:23.490
```

Um, I just want to follow up about tomorrow's commission meeting the clerk's office will be there 30 minutes prior to the start of every meeting to register any of the speakers that wish to speak. 392 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312) 01:28:23.490 --> 01:28:31.020 I will be setting up all of the meetings going forward to make sure that there's room for enough. All the commissioners. 393 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312) 01:28:31.020 --> 01:28:41.850 And if possible to have the speakers actually speak out towards the audience. So measure TV can capture their words in their face as they're speaking. So they won't be speaking directly to the commission. 394 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312) 01:28:41.850 --> 01:29:01.173 Was speaking out if you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to reach out to the president Winkler office. I'm happy to assist in any way, and please continue to share that flyer. So, that way, the public is aware of the future meeting dates throughout the rest of July. So thank you all very much for your time. Yep. 395 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:29:01.173 --> 01:29:04.680 Oh, hey, Brian I heard on NPR I think it was yesterday. 396 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:29:04.680 --> 01:29:12.450 The interview, or at least some reference to the hearings of the meetings will be held held. 397 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:29:12.450 --> 01:29:18.397 Did you all put that out or did somebody else put that out to the radio stations within the media? 398 "Powell, Brian" (2996589312) 01:29:18.397 --> 01:29:29.940 Yes, as of Monday, this week, we, uh, actually published our press release with all of the dates and, uh, we will be following up with another push on that next week as well for the following, uh, dates. 399 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:29:29.940 --> 01:29:46.080 Thank you. Well, there's nothing more. I think we're adjourned. 400 "Bennett, Olivia" (1866579968) 01:29:46.080 --> 01:30:00.648

Some of you on Saturday.